

December 26, 2018

Cynthia C. Dungey, Director
Ohio Department of Job and Family Services
30 E. Broad Street, 32nd Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3414

Dear Director Dungey:

We are pleased to present the Ohio Child Care Advisory Council (CCAC) Annual Report for fiscal year (SFY) 2018. This report provides information about the recommendations, discussions, input and actions of the CCAC during the past year.

CCAC is committed to quality care and education services for all children. This year Council's efforts were focused on influencing and advancing policy and procedures that support the implementation of the State Plan with a strong emphasis on meeting the 2020 and 2025 goals around Step Up To Quality (SUTQ). The goal of the CCAC is to develop an appropriate balance between these interests in pursuit of the best system of care for children, parents, providers, and communities while maintaining a focus on availability, accessibility, affordability, and quality for all children and families.

CCAC is an example of a high functioning ongoing partnership between a regulatory agency and its stakeholder community. Together, CCAC and ODJFS have worked to maintain a focus on the consumer needs while ensuring high-quality access for families and children. There have been many regulatory changes over the past two years and ambitious SUTQ goals set for 2020/2025, making it imperative for effective communication, collaboration and alignment between ODJFS, CCAC and Early Childhood Advisory Council (ECAC). It is recognized and appreciated by the council that ODJFS has increased efforts in SFY 2018 to solicit provider/stakeholder input to inform policy and regulatory changes and to address important issues in early childhood education. CCAC will continue to move toward a model of a high performing inclusive structure providing assistance and recommendations that are timely, relevant, non-duplicative, data driven and mindful of the need for alignment between CCAC, ECAC and ODJFS.

Sincerely,



Becky Ciminillo
Ohio Child Care Advisory Council

cc: Michael McCreight, Assistant Director
Kara Wente, Deputy Director
Michelle Albast, Bureau Chief
Jeff Van Deusen, Bureau Chief
Tracey Chestnut, Bureau Chief



Ohio Child Care Advisory Council Annual Report

July 2017-June 2018



**Ohio Child Care Advisory Council
Annual Report
July 2017 – June 2018**

Table of Contents

Statute Creating the Ohio Child Care Advisory Council..... 3

Composition of Council 3

State Fiscal Year 2018 Council Members 4

CCAC Standing Committees 5

Policy Sub-Committee 5

Availability/Accessibility and Quality 5

Quality Infant/Toddler Care Workgroup..... 5

Recruitment & Retention of Providers/Supply & Demand Workgroup 6

Affordability 7

Market Rate Survey 7

Child Care and Development Fund State Plan..... 8

Administrative 8

Strategic Planning and Focus..... 8

Council Member General Feedback and Discussions..... 9

Council Membership..... 9

Step Up To Quality..... 9

Opioid Addiction Crisis Support for Providers 9

Glossary of Terms/Acronyms..... 10

Statute Creating the Ohio Child Care Advisory Council

Section 5104.08 of the Ohio Revised Code (ORC) directs the creation of the Ohio Child Care Advisory Council (CCAC). This Council is to advise and assist the Ohio Department of Job and Family Services (ODJFS) in the administration of Chapter 5104 ORC and the development of statewide child care policies and procedures.

Council meetings are open to the public and held the fourth Thursday of each quarter. Agendas consist of discussions regarding current issues in child care, updates from ODJFS' Office of Family Assistance (OFA) and needed action items to fulfill the Council's charge.

Composition of Council

Section 5104.08 of the ORC states: "The council shall consist of twenty-two voting members appointed by the director of job and family services with the approval of the governor. The director of job and family services, the director of developmental disabilities, the director of mental health and addiction services, the superintendent of public instruction, the director of health, the director of commerce, and the state fire marshal shall serve as nonvoting members of the council."

Six members shall be representatives of child care centers subject to licensing, the members to represent a variety of centers, including nonprofit and proprietary, from different geographical areas of the state. At least three members shall be parents, guardians or custodians of children receiving child care or publicly funded child care in the child's home, a center, a type A home, a Head Start program, or a type B home at the time of appointment. Three members shall be representatives of in-home aides, type A homes, certified type B homes or head start programs. At least six members shall represent county departments of job and family services. The remaining members shall be representatives of the teaching, child development and health professions, and other individuals interested in the welfare of children. At least six members of the council shall not be employees or licensees of a child day-care center, Head Start program or type A home, or type B home, or in-home aides. Members volunteer for three- year terms. To maintain their voting membership, they must attend at least 50 percent of meetings held each year."

State Fiscal Year (SFY) 2018 Council Members

The Council has 22-member positions. Individuals listed below served on the Council during part or all of SFY 2018.

Member Name	Representation Type	Member Name	Representation Type
Bellmore-Pierse, Nicolle	Parent	Ingram-Collins, Latasha	Parent
Bieber, Michelle	Proprietary	Lindley, Jim	Proprietary
Bigham, Kelly	Not-for-profit	Livas, Renee	CDJFS
Boggs, Maureen	Community Professional	Merriman, Kelly	CDJFS
Chalker, Laura	Not-for-profit	Poelnitz, Traci	Provider – Type A
Ciminillo, Becky	Not-for-profit	Roden, Rhonda	CDJFS
Cox, Carrie	CDJFS	Rose, Windy	CDJFS
Dynia, Jaclyn	Community Professional	Rutter, Beth	Community Professional
Fisher, Shannon	Parent	Selway, Paula	Proprietary
Haile, Asyia	Provider – Type B	Sewell, Rhonda	Community Professional
Haney, Deana	CDJFS	Shiple, Patricia	Provider – Type B
Hite, Mary Jo	CDJFS	Owens, Wilbert	Not-for-profit
Ex-Officio Members			
Alloy, Valerie	Ohio Department of Health Ohio Department of Mental Health & Addiction Services	Richards, Jay	Ohio Department of Commerce/Building Standards
Breckenridge, Jye	Ohio Department of Health	Smith, Alan	Ohio Department of Commerce/State
Carlton, Stephanie	Ohio Department of Education	Spurgeon, Bill (William)	Ohio Department of Commerce/State Fire Marshal
Courts, Melissa	Ohio Department of Developmental Disabilities		
ODJFS, OFA Staff			
Albast, Michelle	Chestnut, Tracey	Kaiser, Angie	Smith, Tonia
Van Deusen, Jeff	Wente, Kara		

CCAC Standing Committees

The CCAC historically convened two sub-committees as part of standard practice; policy and information technology (IT). Over the course of this last few state fiscal years it has become a more common practice for information technology work and updates to be reviewed with the larger Council and for discussions and recommendations to be made at that time. As a result, the IT sub-committee was not convened. As future system changes are pursued, a workgroup will be convened if it is deemed necessary by the Council. The IT sub-committee will no longer be a standing sub-committee.

Policy Sub-Committee

The Policy Sub-Committee is responsible for developing recommendations to inform the ODJFS Director of the planning and development of child care policies, procedures, and regulations. The committee focuses on the health and safety of children, the administration of regulated child care, the overall quality of all child care settings and publicly funded child care. Council's primary focus is to ensure that Ohio's child care policies encourage essential and foundational health, safety and developmentally appropriate practices and quality standards, and to recommend policy changes to ensure accountability, accessibility, affordability and high quality to the consumer.

Member's responsibilities include the following:

- Reviewing existing rules and participating in the ODJFS rule revision process.
- Gathering and disseminating relevant research from other states and sources to inform and contribute to the process.

Due to the high volume of policy changes over the past two years, the Council determined that best practice in regard to the policy sub-committee work moving forward would be to invite the full Council when Policy Sub-Committee work in regard to policy is needed. All Council members are informed of meetings and have the option to participate.

The Policy Sub-Committee convened as follows during the SFY resulting in recommendations for clarifications and changes to draft rules.

- On January 4, 2018, draft rules for Publicly Funded Child Care (PFCC), Chapter 5101:2-16 of the Ohio Administrative Code (OAC), were reviewed.
- On August 24, 2017, draft rules for Day Camps, Chapter 5101:2-18 of the OAC, were reviewed, including staff/child ratios and group size.

Availability/Accessibility and Quality

The Council identified topics of interest. Those topics were cross referenced with requirements in the Child Care and Development Block Grant (CCDBG) Act. Workgroups were convened to identify and make recommendations on two specific topics that were of interest to the Council as well as required by CCDBG.

Quality Infant/Toddler Care Workgroup

The Quality Infant/Toddler Care workgroup discussed improving the supply and quality of child care services for infants and toddlers. The workgroup was formed during SFY 2017 and focused on the following:

- Age group definitions.
- Staff to child ratios.

- Specialized professional development (PD).

The group's work resulted in a letter to the Director in December 2017 that included the following recommended rule changes that may result in improved quality of care and increase the supply of quality child care for this age group.

- Child care staff members that care for infants/toddlers (birth-three years) should be required to attend a minimum amount of training hours that are specifically related to the care of children in that age group. The PD should be Ohio Approved, and the delivery format can be in-person or online. Council stated in the letter that there was an awareness of the need to increase the availability of this type of PD, as well as the need to ensure that it is low cost or free for programs.
- Family Child Care rule 5101:2-13-18(A)(1) of the OAC states that a provider may not care for more than three children under the age of two years. It was recommended that the rule be changed to allow no more than three children under the age of 18 months (definition of an infant) for both type A and type B family child care home providers. This would allow a provider to care for up to three infants and a toddler between the ages of 18-24 months, possibly a sibling of one of the infants, while maintaining compliance with the OAC. This rule change will benefit providers that serve families with multiple young children, such as foster care and blended families.

Recruitment & Retention of Providers/Supply & Demand Workgroup

The Recruitment & Retention of Providers and Supply & Demand workgroup discussed the development and implementation of strategies to increase the supply of high quality child care providers for children and families in underserved areas, specifically those providers that serve families eligible for PFCC. The workgroup was formed in SFY 2017 and focused on how the Department can help providers become star rated in Ohio's Step Up To Quality (SUTQ) quality rating and improvement system to help meet the 2020 & 2025 goals by implementing the following strategies.

- Provide education/training and technical assistance.
- Provide resources/tools.
- Provide an extensive marketing campaign.

The group's work resulted in a letter to the Director in December 2017 that included the following recommendations to help providers become star rated, support the CCDBG requirements, and, most importantly, meet the 2020 and 2025 star rating goals.

- Education/Training
 - During each licensing visit between January 1, 2018 and December 31, 2019, licensing specialists review information about SUTQ (using pre-made handouts/packet/flash drive) with each Administrator/Owner as well as send a follow up email. The flash-drive would contain a budgeting tool showing providers the financial benefits of becoming rated.
 - Provide SUTQ training and technical assistance through local child care resource and referral (CCR&R) agencies.
- Resources
 - Place a link to a SUTQ Tool Kit that includes a budgeting tool as mentioned above and information about the 2020/2025 SUTQ requirements on the ODJFS and county agency webpages.
- Marketing
 - Kick off an extensive marketing campaign targeting all licensed programs to inform providers about the 2020/2025 SUTQ requirements. The campaign may include:
 - Pop ups (information) on OCLQS, ODJFS licensing website and JFS county agency websites, Ohio Professional Registry (OPR) and the Early Childhood Ohio website.

- Utilize statewide/local provider-focused associations, organizations, groups, etc. to get marketing materials to providers. (i.e. local CCR&R agencies, the Ohio Association of Child Care Providers, the Ohio Association for the Education of Young Children, the Ohio Afterschool Network, (OAN).
- Add information about the 2020/2025 SUTQ requirements to the pre-licensing Orientation and Administrator Trainings.
- Add information about the 2020/2025 SUTQ requirements to information in materials for new programs. For example, add information about requirements to new program applications on OCLQS (Question: Do you currently have, or do you intend to complete a provider agreement to serve families receiving PFCC?)
- Add a special targeted campaign for those programs that are unrated and serve children in PFCC.
- Create peer workgroups where rated programs help unrated programs similar to the One Star seminars.

The Director's reply to both Letters of Recommendation in March 2018 included:

- A list of several efforts that the Department has implemented to encourage programs to participate in SUTQ: A targeted call campaign to inform 3,879 unrated programs about SUTQ; Information Fairs were held across Ohio in each of the 12 CCR&R service delivery areas and more than 365 providers attended; licensing rule changes were made to include a pre-licensing training requirement that includes information on SUTQ; SUTQ information was added to the Administrator training; SUTQ brochures targeted to families and providers were published and placed online and distributed; several supporting documents to assist providers with SUTQ including "SUTQ Rating Progressions", checklists and a guidance document were developed; an estimator tool is available online to help providers understand the financial impacts of SUTQ.
- The Department's agreement that PD, such as specialized training, is an important contributor to quality early childhood settings. The Director stated that she has challenged her team to determine where specialized training would be beneficial for providers and agreed to keep the Council apprised of progress.
- In regard to the recommended change in ratios for children under two in family child care homes, the Director stated that this would mean a change to the ORC and that her staff would conduct research to determine if the ratio change would be a positive change for Ohio family providers. The Director stated that the research could be used to inform the General Assembly to see if they wanted to propose the change in ORC.

Both letters and the Director's response are available on the child care website, <http://jfs.ohio.gov/cdc/advisorycouncil.stm>

New Time, Attendance and Payment System (TAP)

Updates on the new TAP system were provided at Council meetings throughout SFY 2018. Council members were given an opportunity to view a TAP demonstration led by Controltec, the state's vendor for this system. Council members asked clarifying questions and provided feedback and input about the new system as well as the roll-out to providers and families. The new TAP system is set to begin in December of 2018.

Affordability

Market Rate Survey (MRS)

There were several updates and discussions about the MRS at Council meetings in SFY 2018 as ODJFS

was in the process of securing a new vendor to conduct the MRS. The Council provided feedback on past MRS questions and gave input for provider friendly changes for the new survey. Council members requested that the Department consider paying adequate rates to providers to ensure equal access to child care for all families.

Child Care and Development Fund (CCDF) State Plan

Updates on the CCDF State Plan were provided throughout the year. Council members shared ideas, provided feedback and gave input to the Department during quarterly meetings. In April 2018, CCAC members were given the opportunity to participate in a workgroup made up of representatives from Council, the Early Childhood Advisory Council and ODJFS to review and provide feedback on the CCDBG required State Plan. This workgroup identified responses to be clarified, as well as echoed ongoing discussions expressed about equal access for families.

Administrative

Strategic Planning and Focus

The CCAC held a strategic planning meeting in August of 2015 to determine strategies and areas of focus moving forward. Council reached agreement on several strategies and protocols in areas as mentioned in the SFY 2016 Annual Report. Below is a Strategic Plan progress update regarding the work done by the CCAC during SFY 2018:

- **Strengths of the CCAC past and current work**
 - There have been several major policy and system changes during SFY 2017 and SFY 2018. Council continued to provide valuable input, feedback and recommendations to ODJFS from multiple stakeholder perspectives.
- **Areas of opportunity and improvement**
 - CCAC leadership continued to be intentional when choosing new CCAC members to ensure a diverse representation. Members were selected to ensure that the entire state was represented geographically, as well as to ensure that all areas of early childhood were represented.
 - Agenda items were created with Council input, and meeting time was utilized during SFY 2018 to provide opportunities for CCAC to make recommendations to ODJFS to inform their work.

Communication

Improved communication between ODJFS and the ECE stakeholder community continued as a priority for the Council during SFY 2018. The Council identified and provided input for areas where effective and timely communication to stakeholders was necessary:

- SUTQ 2020/2025 goals-Letter of recommendation sent to Director
- New Time and Attendance (TAP) roll-out
- Market Rate Survey
- Rule changes-Council focused on new background check process beginning in October 2017 and new day camp rules
- Bold Beginnings website
- Provider data-Council recommended that OFA provide Center/Type A/Type B/Day Camp data at quarterly meetings as done in past

Council Member General Feedback and Discussions

Council shared concerns about the volume of changes and the financial implications to providers in order to comply with the new licensing rule package, day camp regulations, background check process and required State Plan implementation and the 2020/2025 SUTQ goals. ODJFS responded to the Council recommendations, as well as those from other stakeholders, to initiate changes including to bring the 38 counties into alignment with payment rates as suggested by the 2016 MRS. A committee was formed to focus on PD, wage and retention plan for Ohio's early childhood workforce.

Council Membership

During SFY 2018, the Council reviewed and discussed the roles and responsibilities of Council members to ensure that members, including several new members during SFY 2018, understood the expectations of serving on Council. Meeting attendance and frequency were discussed. Council attendance was reviewed to ensure that current members were actively attending, as required, more than 50% of meetings during a two-year period. Meeting frequency was also discussed, and the Council voted to send a Letter of Recommendation to the Director to change CCAC meeting frequency from quarterly to bi-monthly due to the high volume of policy and regulatory changes affecting early childhood education. A Letter of Recommendation was written and sent in August 2017. This letter and the Directors response are available on the child care website, <http://jfs.ohio.gov/cdc/advisorycouncil.stm>.

The Director sent a response in September 2017 and stated that the Council will continue to meet quarterly, but with an option to meet as needed to discuss agenda items that need immediate attention outside of quarterly meetings. It was noted that ODJFS would continue to monitor the meeting frequency need. In the reply, the Director clarified the role of the Council as providing a platform for the following:

- OFA to share updates and information with stakeholders.
- Council members to provide feedback on behalf of the stakeholders they represent on items identified by OFA.
- Council to make formal recommendations specific to child care.
- Other organizations to get feedback for their work.

Step Up To Quality

The Council held a brainstorm session during a quarterly meeting to provide recommendations and input on the following topics to inform ODJFS' work related to SUTQ: (Each Council member was grouped according to their role on Council)

- Informing families about importance of quality child care.
- Parent engagement in a child care setting.
- Community engagement in a child care setting.

Opioid Addiction Crisis Support for Providers

During SFY 2018, Council members discussed the need for support for families and providers in the midst of the opioid crisis in Ohio. The Council requested that information about existing state supported resources be made available to providers experiencing issues related to the crisis. The Council decided to continue discussions on efforts and resources for providers and families in response to the Opioid Addiction Crisis and its effect on early childhood education in Ohio in SFY 2019.

Glossary of Terms/Acronyms

This glossary of terms is provided as a convenience for readers of this report.

Accessibility

The availability of child care when and where a family needs it.

Affordability

The degree to which the price of child care is an expense that is feasible for families. High-quality care may be available, but it may not be affordable for families with low or moderate incomes.

Availability

The degree to which a family has ready access to needed child care. Factors affecting this include not only geographic location, but also the availability of care for the child's age and at the needed time of day.

Child Care Resource and Referral Agency

Provides services to early education and child care professionals working with children and their families, agencies serving families, businesses, and communities.

Child Care and Development Block Grant (CCDBG) Act of 2014.

The Child Care and Development Block Grant (CCDBG) Act of 2014 is a law established to set minimum child care assistance eligibility standards and training requirements that will strengthen child care in the United States and support success for children and families.

Child Care and Development Fund (CCDF)

The Child Care and Development Fund (CCDF) provides funding to States, that enable low-income parents to work or pursue education and training so that they may better support their families while at the same time promoting the learning and development of their children. The CCDF also provides funding to enhance the quality of child care for all children. Each state must create a State Plan to ensure full implementation of the Child Care and Development Block Grant (CCDBG) Act of 2014.

Child Care Center

Any place that is not the permanent residence of the licensee or administrator in which child care is provided, with or without compensation, for seven to 12 children at one time, or any place in which child care is provided for 13 or more children at one time. Child care centers must comply with all rules in OAC Chapter 5101:2-12.

Council

Advisory body to an agency or department.

Family Child Care Homes

Child care providers that are regulated to provide services to children at their residence (Type A and Type B).

Market Rate Survey

A state and federally mandated survey. The survey conducted by ODJFS in partnership with a vendor to collect and analyze the rates for child care services paid across the state. The rates must be adequate to

ensure equal access to child care for families with limited incomes.

Professional Development (PD)

The opportunity in which early childhood educators participate in the education, training, and development of opportunities to increase the knowledge base, skill set, or perspectives brought forward in a variety of techniques such as face to face, online, or study group.

Ohio Approved (OA)

Process for professional development offerings and instructors to ensure early care and education and afterschool professionals receive high quality professional development to maximize the learning and development of children in their care.

Ohio Administrative Code (OAC)

Ohio Administrative Code contains all of the rules passed by the state agencies using authorities delegated by the Ohio Revised Code (ORC).

Ohio Professional Registry

The statewide centralized learning management system for early childhood and afterschool professionals. This system is managed by the Ohio Child Care Resource and Referral Association.

Office of Family Assistance (OFA)

This Office within ODJFS is responsible for the state's publicly funded child care program, SUTQ and the regulation of child care centers, family child care homes, In Home Aides and approved day camps. In SFY 2018, the child care program was managed by the following individuals:

Kara Wentz, Deputy Director, OFA

Mindy Kowalaski, Chief, Policy and Operations

Tracey Chestnut, Chief, Bureau of Child Care Policy and TA

Michelle Albast, Chief, Bureau of Child Care Operational Support

Jeffery Van Deusen, Chief, Bureau of Child Care Licensing and Monitoring

Ohio Child Licensing and Quality System (OCLQS)

Automated system used by ODJFS and the Ohio Department of Education (ODE) to support child care licensing and Step Up To Quality (SUTQ).

Ohio Revised Code (ORC)

Ohio Revised Code is all of the laws that have been passed by the Ohio General Assembly (members of the House of Representatives and the Ohio Senate).

Publicly Funded Child Care (PFCC)

Child care program that provides child care assistance to families engaged in work, school or approved training activity.

Quality

In child care, the degree to which children are safe, healthy and receive appropriate stimulation. High-quality care settings are responsive; allow children to form secure attachments to nurturing adults; offer engaging, appropriate activities that facilitate healthy growth and development; and either prepare children for school or promote their success in school.

Step Up To Quality (SUTQ)

Step Up To Quality is a voluntary five-star quality rating and improvement system for early care and education programs.

Time, Attendance and Payment (TAP) system

The Time, Attendance and Payment (TAP) system is used to record attendance for children receiving PFCC and to calculate payment for providers.

Type A Home

A child care setting that also is the permanent residence of the administrator, who may care for seven to 12 children at one time, including any children under 6 who are related to the administrator or to an employee.

Type B Home

A child care setting that also is the permanent residence of the administrator, who may care for one to six children at one time but no more than three children under age 2. If Type B home provider cares for children eligible for the publicly funded child care program, the provider must be licensed by the ODJFS.