Ohio Child Care Advisory Council
Annual Report

July 2015-June 2016

November 16, 2016

Cynthia C. Dungey, Director
Ohio Department of Job and Family Services
30 E. Broad Street, 32nd Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3414

Dear Director Dungey:

We are pleased to present the state fiscal year (SFY) 2016 Ohio Child Care Advisory Council (CCAC) Annual Report. This report provides information on the discussions, input, and actions of the CCAC during the past year.

The CCAC is committed to quality care and education services for all children. This includes efforts focused on supporting the system change in Ohio through the Early Learning Challenge Grant and the implementation of the 5- star Quality Rating and Improvement System (QRIS) while advocating for families to ensure they have access to high-quality child care. We strive to develop an appropriate balance between these interests in pursuit of the best system of care for children, parents, providers, and communities while maintaining a focus on availability, accessibility, affordability, and quality for children and families.

As we continued to work and refine our processes to ensure high-quality child care for Ohio's families, we reviewed CCAC responsibilities and roles as mandated in Ohio Revised Code to ensure our focus is organized and deliberate. During this process, we often struggled with our ever-evolving world of early childhood education (ECE) in Ohio and our role within the narrowly mandated framework of the Ohio Department of Job and Family Services (ODJFS) CCAC structure. This reflection has highlighted the need for a facilitated conversation with the ODJFS and Council leadership of both the CCAC and the Early Childhood Advisory Council (ECAC) to reflect, analyze, and strategically plan to ensure a coordinated function of both of the councils. The CCAC has moved toward a model of a high performing inclusive structure with recommendations that are data driven. To ensure all recommendations can be based on facts and relevant, timely information, the collaboration and communication between the CCAC and the ECAC need to be purposeful, responsive, and transparent.

The CCAC is an example of a high functioning ongoing partnership between a regulatory agency and its community. Together, the CCAC and the ODJFS have worked to maintain a rigorous focus on the consumer needs while ensuring high-quality access for families and children. We have emphasized the collection of data and facts in guiding our work this year and have made all recommendations based on supporting evidence.

Sincerely,

Pamela M. Perrino, Chair
Ohio Child Care Advisory Council

cc: Michael McCreight, Assistant Director
    Kara Wente, Deputy Director
    Michelle Albast, Bureau Chief
    Jeff Van Deusen, Bureau Chief
    Tracey Chestnut, Bureau Chief

Ohio Child Care Advisory Council
Annual Report
July 2015 – June 2016

Table of Contents

Statute Creating the Ohio Child Care Advisory Council

Section 5104.08 of the Ohio Revised Code (ORC) directs the creation of the Ohio Child Care Advisory Council. This council is to advise and assist the ODJFS in the administration of Chapter 5104. ORC and the development of statewide child care policies and procedures.

Council meetings are open to the public and held the fourth Thursday of each month. Agendas consist of discussions regarding current issues in child care, updates from ODJFS' Office of Family Assistance and needed action items to fulfill the council's charge.

Composition of Council

Section 5104.08 ORC states: "The council shall consist of twenty-two voting members appointed by the director of job and family services with the approval of the governor. The director of job and family services, the director of developmental disabilities, the director of mental health and addiction services, the superintendent of public instruction, the director of health, the director of commerce, and the state fire marshal shall serve as nonvoting members of the council."

Six members shall be representatives of child care centers subject to licensing, the members to represent a variety of centers, including nonprofit and proprietary, from different geographical areas of the state. At least three members shall be parents, guardians or custodians of children receiving child care or publicly funded child care in the child's home, a center, a type A home, a head start program, a certified type B home, or a type B home at the time of appointment. Three members shall be representatives of in-home aides, type A homes, certified type B homes or head start programs. At least six members shall represent county departments of job and family services. The remaining members shall be representatives of the teaching, child development and health professions, and other individuals interested in the welfare of children. At least six members of the council shall not be employees or licensees of a child day-care center, head start program or type A home, or providers operating a certified type B home or type B home, or in-home aides. Members volunteer for three- year terms. To maintain their voting membership, they must attend at least 50 percent of meetings held each year."

State Fiscal Year (SFY) 2016 Council Members

Member Name	Representation Type	Member Name	Representation Type
Burnette, Danielle	County Dept. of Job & Family Services (CDJFS)	Lowe, Julie	Not-for-profit
Haney, Deana	CDJFS	Piazza-King, Julie	Not-for-profit
Livas, Renee	CDJFS	Bellmore-Pierse, Nicolle	Parent
Moon, Crystal	CDJFS	Fisher, Shannon	Parent
Story, Amy	CDJFS	Stertbach, Sarah	Parent
Scarberry, Whitney	CDJFS	Bieber, Michelle	Proprietary
Smith, Dwaine	CDJFS	Lindley, Jim	Proprietary
Wallace, Lolita	CDJFS	Selway, Paula	Proprietary
Boggs, Maureen	Community Professional	Montana, Gail	Type A
Dynia, Jaclyn	Community Professional	Haile, Asyia	Type B
Perrino, Pam	Community Professional *Co-chair*	Shipley, Patricia	Type B
Sewell, Rhonda	Community Professional		
Jones, Lori	Not-for-profit		
Ex-Officio Members			
Courts, Melissa	Ohio Department of Health		Ohio Department of Commerce/Building Standards
Saunders, Diane	Ohio Department of Education		Ohio Department of Commerce/State Fire Marshal
Alloy, Valerie	Ohio Department of Mental Health and Addiction	Hauck, Kim	Ohio Department of Developmental Disabilities

Administrative
Strategic Planning –CCAC and Focus

The CCAC held a strategic planning meeting in August of 2015 to determine strategies and areas of focus moving forward during the July 2015-June 2016 fiscal year. Council reached agreement on the following strategies and protocols:

o Member role.
- Be mindful and explicit to represent the role for which one is appointed.
- Give feedback based on the position held on the CCAC.
- Identify when one's response is either
  - Opinion;
  - Observation; or
  - Research and facts.

o Strengths of the CCAC past and current work.
- Ability to identify current trends in the state in early childhood education.
- Ability to provide reflection and recommendations on current policy and future policy and its impact on family, children, and providers.
- Ability to identify and communicate the challenges experienced by providers, families, and children participating in the early childhood system in Ohio.
- Ability to look at topics from multiple views.
- Connecting data, change, and impact on the leadership and the early childhood education (ECE) field.

o Areas of opportunity and improvement.
- Expand CCAC voice in local communities.
- Improve the flow of communication from state agencies back to the provider field to ensure that it is timely, relevant, and transparent.
- Improve connections to ensure greater collaboration between CCAC and ECAC.
- Move the monthly CCAC meeting to a date after ECAC to ensure purposeful, timely, and transparent communication from ECAC to the CCAC meetings.
- Ensure that a representative from the ECAC be present at each of the CCAC meetings to share updates from the previous week's ECAC meeting for continuity of information and efforts between the two councils, in relation to the work in the ECE Field.
- Identify major areas of focus for the July 2015-August 2016 fiscal year.
- Collect and analyze data to make recommendations that would improve SUTQ participation rates.

Communication
o ODJFS shift from mass emails to include the RSS feeds for future communication.
- The CCAC expressed concerns about the different databases currently used to identifying email addresses for recipients of communications. Recommendation was made to have emails from multiple databases merged so all are receiving timely updates.
- Council requested a mechanism that would ensure that ECE stakeholders, those not providing direct service for child care/ECE services, could have access to communications.

o Identified the need to have timely updates on other work in the ECE system to ensure that CCAC recommendations remain current, timely, and relevant. The identified topics of work included:
- Higher Education Articulation Group recommendations and decisions.

- Family Engagement website creation and implementation that is to be the parent portal companion to Early Childhood Ohio website.
- Kindergarten Readiness Assessment (KRA) and Early Learning Assessment (ELA) parent information.
- Governor's office plans for the Casino Dollars.
- ODJFS Step Up To Quality (SUTQ) Validation Study progress updates, awarded contractor, and presentation of the final report.
- Disaster Preparedness Plan updates and implementation timelines.
- Groundwork Ohio updates, focuses, and findings.
- Regular and timely updates from ECAC.
- Updates from Dr. Angel Rhodes, ECE Officer for the Governor so decisions and recommendations from CCAC are based on the most current and immediate future landscape of early childhood in Ohio.
  o Discussion and update on the Annual Child Care Licensing Report.
- Council expressed concern that statute only requires that the number of inspections, number and types of violations, and steps to correct violations are included in the report to the Governor. We recognize that ODJFS chose to report on more than was required and commend them for their choice, but are concerned that data relevant to deaths while in child care are not included in the report. This data will be included in the future as it is a requirement of the Child Care Development Block Grant (CCDBG) Act.
  o CCAC requested that the letters of response from the Director are available on the website as well as the letters from the previous years.

CCAC Committees
Policy Sub-Committee
o The Policy Committee is responsible for developing recommendations to inform the planning and development of child care policies, procedures, and regulations. The committee focuses on the health and safety of children and the overall quality of all child care settings. Council's primary focus is to ensure that Ohio's child care policies encourage essential and foundational health, safety and developmentally appropriate practices and quality standards and recommending policy changes to ensure accountability, accessibility, affordability and high quality to the consumer.
o Member's responsibilities include the following:
- Reviewing existing rules and participating in the ODJFS rule revision and reduction project including:
  - Updates and revisions to Chapter 5101:2-16 of the Ohio Administrative Code (OAC).
  - Updates and revisions to Chapter 5101:2-17 of the OAC.
  - Review and consolidation of Chapters 5101:2-12, 5101:2-13 and 5101:2-14 OAC. This process will ultimately lead to one chapter of rules for both Type A and Type B family child care homes and a reduction of rules for both family child care and center licensing rules by realigning the rules to make them more concise and consumer friendly.
- Gathering and disseminating relevant research from other states and sources to inform and contribute to the process.
- Providing feedback on current rules, federal guidelines and state initiatives such as the state's Step Up To Quality (SUTQ) star rating system and its impact on the consumer and provider.

Information Technology Sub-Committee
The Information Technology (IT) Committee is responsible for developing recommendations to ODJFS on ways to enhance the Child Care Information Data System (CCIDS). CCIDS streamlines and centralizes the administration of publicly funded child care in Ohio. It helps county agency caseworkers determine eligibility for services, authorizes children to specific providers and issues direct deposit payments. Also, the committee makes recommendations on the Electronic Child Care (ECC) swipe card system used to record children's time and attendance. The subcommittee's primary focus is the following:

o   Reviewing various communications materials for Ohio ECC and providing input.
o   Providing recommendations to the department for enhancements.
o   Focusing on improvements to current child care systems that create efficiencies and automated tools for the department, users, and stakeholders.

Ad-Hoc Committees
Rural Child Care Services
The Rural Child Care Ad-Hoc Committee was charged to provide recommendations to improve the affordability, the availability and the quality of child care services for consumers in rural communities of Ohio. The committee was established in 2014. The committee analyzed data and identified how rural counties needs are similar and different from urban child care needs. Once the data was reviewed the committee identified policy and or rules that may inhibit increased child care quality and access in rural areas. Members identified and brought recommendations forward to the CACC. The responsibility of the committee included the following:

o   Collect data and reviewed the data looking for obstacles and gaps.
o   Make recommendations for policy change that could improve options for care in rural communities.

Step Up To Quality (SUTQ) Survey
The SUTQ Ad-Hoc Committee determined benefits and barriers in reaching the desired SUTQ Rating within the statewide child care system. This committee focused on the following:

o   Discussion points for creating priorities to ensure increased participation in SUTQ.
o   Current data available and identified additional data necessary to guide the work in identifying barriers to providers in obtaining, maintaining, or increasing the quality rating.
o   Connected other agencies and organizations that have relevant data such as ODE and groundWork to inform work and directions.

Availability
Council Recommendations and Discussions Concerning Availability

Increase Programs Participating in SUTQ
Quality Achievement Awards (QAA)
o   Council recommended to the Director that the Quality Achievement Awards be maintained going forward so that all child care providers are incentivized to participate in the Step Up to Quality Program. The program has had a significant impact on improving child care in Ohio by better preparing children for success in Kindergarten. It is the opinion and recommendation of the CCAC that the elimination of the Quality Achievement Award would negatively impact the care and education of young children in Ohio.

Child Care Development Fund State Plan
o   Meetings were held to report on the Child Care Development Fund state plan. The council shared discussion around concerns with items in the state plan. ODJFS staff provided comment and ODJFS staff explained that amendments are ongoing and made to the state plan as changes occur at the state level.

Accessibility
Council Recommendations and Discussions Concerning Accessibility

Rural Child Care
o   Discussed and identified barriers for child care in rural areas.
   *   Lack of licensed programs in areas where parents need care.
   *   Hours of operation in center programs do not always meet the needs of families seeking child care.
   *   Accessibility to public transportation or private modes of transportation that are reliable.
   *   Providers' lack of knowledge and skills to sustainably operate a business that effectively handles finances and understand and implement policies, procedures, and systems that are most effective for small businesses success.
   *   The need for data that indicates when and where parents need care in underserved rural areas.
   *   The cost of providing child care in rural areas impacts the family's options for finding affordable care.
o   Explored the idea that data accurate for rural areas may require community level assessments to determine need and encourage greater community involvement to spread the benefits of high-quality programming.
o   KRA data can be used to identify any county where the children are below the state mean regarding their readiness for kindergarten. However, there is no one solution for kindergarten readiness.

House Bill 64-Casino Settlement Funds ($40 million)
o   Council discussed how to allocate $40 million outlined in H.B. 64. Goal is to ensure that all programs serving publicly funded children are rated by 2020, and all center-based and Type A family child care homes are highly rated by 2025 including:
   *   Supports and strategies to be implemented to assist programs in reaching these goals; meeting the accessibility needs of rural communities and ensuing an adequate supply of high-quality early child care.
   *   Targeted approach to identify low income working families and programs serving these families.
   *   Increased reimbursement rates in rural communities.
   *   Increase reimbursement rates for 3-, 4- and 5- star rated programs.
   *   Long term 2020 sustainability.

Multi-Function School Activity Bus
o   Council expressed the need for the ODE and the ODJFS to work with the Ohio Department of Public Safety on the multi-function school activity bus regulation to ensure transportation remained a viable option for programs and families.

Affordability
Council Recommendations and Discussion Concerning Affordability

Market Rate Survey
o   Representatives from The Ohio State University shared the Market Rate Survey format and Council made the following recommendations:
  - Conduct an automated call before the survey is sent that includes the date of the email.
  - Share information with CCR&R and county agencies to post on their website that would allow programs to request an individualized link if they did not receive one.
  - Address age categories for all the provider types and license status regarding capacity.
  - CCAC was encouraged to email additional suggestions.

Quality Achievement Awards
o   Discussion on the manual procedure letter was shared in regard to QAA and consequences for programs revolved around the timing of the letter.
  - A recommendation was made to plan future notifications of financial impact around a business fiscal year. The ODJFS should take into account that the notification may fit the state fiscal year but may not be consistent with most small business formats that typically operate on a calendar year for budgeting and planning purposes. Announcements of fund reduction at mid calendar year have the potential to have a devastating financial impact on small business mid-way through their budget cycle. The discussion was held exploring the possibility of holding off on the QAA reduction until January of 2017.

Articulation Group
o   Council shared information about the articulation workgroup that is meeting to ensure early childhood professionals have a clear pathway from the high school career track programs and technical school, to Child Development Associate Credential, to Associate degree, to a Baccalaureate degree.
  - Council discussed the need to remain informed about decisions and processes as it directly impacts the available pool of professionals required for programs to maintain 3-, 4- and 5-star ratings.

Quality
Council Recommendations and Discussion Concerning Quality

Step Up To Quality Survey
o   SUTQ Survey was completed with all ODJFS licensed child care providers in an effort to gain a better provider perspective on the most challenging, costly and least understood areas of SUTQ by developmental domain.
o   Learning and Development Domain
  - Develop specific training tailored for administrators on program standards for their provider type (Type A, Type B, and center based).
  - Ensure that financial supports for 3-, 4-, and 5-star rated programs cover the actual cost of purchasing, implementing, and maintaining curriculum and child screening and assessment.
  - Create additional supports for all program types for curriculum planning and child screening assessment.
o   Administrative and Leadership Domain

- Consolidate and reduce the SUTQ paperwork.
- Develop training and technical assistance on system support to manage and complete the documentation required for SUTQ relevant to the program type (Type A and Type B family child care home providers).
  - Staff Qualification and Professional Development Domain
    - Review the Career Pathways Levels (CPL) for changes that improve opportunities for professional development credit for in-service training taken, and for year of experience worked in the field.
    - Explore financial supports for staff education and professional development. All program types reported this domain to be the most challenging and costly to implement. This data was before the loss of QAA dollars which supported this domain.
    - Ensure articulation agreements for Ohio approved training transfer toward college credits toward higher degrees.
    - Revise education requirements to the Ohio Approved process to include credit for electronic based learning.
  - Family and Community Partnerships Domain
    - Identify and inform providers of other local, regional, and community-based organizations who are knowledgeable about family and community engagement work with the intent to create a provider network of evidence-based practices and supports around community and family engagement.
    - Coordinate with other state agencies that are working with star rated providers to help them build connections and develop systems to promote family engagement and community partnerships.
    - Revisit family and community engagement to improve and broaden the variety of activities that would count for points in the system. Ensure that the activities are result/outcome driven and provide variety to different local needs, especially for 4 and 5-star programs.
  - Optional Extra Points - Staff-Child Ratio and Group Size
    - Identify and partner with other organizations knowledgeable in accreditation to build a technical assistance model to provide support to programs seeking accreditation.
    - Revisit the point system for accreditation to ensure that the points awarded adequately compensate the program for the cost of business changes necessary to achieve and maintain the accreditation.
  - Other Recommendations Based on Comments from the Survey include
    - Revisiting exemptions to SUTQ including:
      - Pediatric Mental Health Facilities.
      - Programs operating during non-traditional hours.
      - Programs having limited hours of operation.
      - Some school age programs.
      - Some summer programs.
    - Create and invest in a communication plan to support SUTQ by recipient type with targeted messages to:
      - Families.
      - Center Directors.
      - Owners.
      - Non-Profit boards who control operation of programs.
      - Family Child Care Providers.
      - Local and Political Leaders.

Early Learning Assessment
o ODJFS presented an overview and update on the Early Learning Assessment (ELA). CCAC had the following recommendations and comments:
- For students that are in both ODJFS and ODE programs the information should follow the child to both tenants as this would reduce the need for duplication of assessments.
- Clearer communication on who is providing training on the ELA.
- ELA requirement should be waived if the program was in the process to be rated and was waiting for the state to release the state approved ECE curriculums that will have an accompanying assessment tool.
- Council expressed concerns about duplication with the ELA and state ECE Curriculum.

PD Certificates
o ODJFS provided an overview of the new Ohio Professional Development Certificate (PD Certificate). CCAC had the following recommendations and comments:
- Child care staff move from program to program and directors need to have the ability to know if staff have kept up their credential and completed their training.
- Child care staff with a college degree might be considered exempt from the requirement to complete the PD Certificate and overview training as it could be considered redundant to existing knowledge/training for college graduates.
- Ohio's Child Development Overview and Ohio's Approach to Quality required for all ECE professionals in Ohio be embedded into teacher preparation courses in Ohio colleges and universities.
- Ohio Board of Regents should explore how to ensure that this is part of the curriculum of ECE certifications and Pre K-3 teacher degrees.

Glossary of Terms/Acronyms
This glossary of terms is provided as a convenience for readers of this report.

Accessibility
The availability of child care when and where a family needs it.

Affordability
The degree to which the price of child care is a feasible family expense. High-quality care may be available, but it may not be affordable for families with low or moderate incomes.

Availability
The degree to which a family has ready access to needed child care. Factors affecting this include not only geographic location, but also the availability of care for the child's age and at the needed time of day.

Child Care Information Data System (CCIDS)
The automated statewide system that helps county caseworkers determine families' eligibility for publicly funded child care services; authorizes individual children to specific providers; issues direct deposit payments to providers; tracks each child's attendance times with the child care provider; and calculates the payment for child care services. CCIDS has many subsystems:
o Licensing

- Eligibility and Authorization (EA) - The case management system used to process applications, determine eligibility and authorize services for families receiving publicly funded child care in Ohio.
- Centralized Payments (CP) - Centralized Payments is part of the integrated statewide automated system used for paying providers. CP stores provider banking, rate and agreement information and receives payment information from the Electronic Child Care system.
- Ohio Electronic Child Care (Ohio ECC)
- Provider Portal
- Central Office License Tracking System (COLTS)
- System for Online Licensing Applications and Requests (SOLAR)
- Step Up To Quality (SUTQ)
- Outlier Technology-Automated Inspection Tool
- Ohio Child Licensing and Quality System (OCLQS)

Child Care Center
Any place that is not the permanent residence of the licensee or administrator in which child care is provided, with or without compensation, for seven to 12 children at one time, or any place in which child care is provided for 13 or more children at one time. Child care centers must comply with all rules in OAC Chapter 5101:2-12.

Council
Advisory body to an agency or department.

Domains
Areas of development that occur during the early childhood years and support school readiness strategies.

Family Child Care Homes
Child care providers that are regulated to provide services to children at their residence (Type A and Type B).

Initial Eligibility
The initial determination review to determine if a family is eligible for child care benefits. The current initial gross income requirement is 130 percent of the federal poverty guidelines.

Market Rate Survey
A biannual federally mandated survey. The 2015 survey conducted by ODJFS in partnership with the Ohio State University Statistical Consulting Service to collect data to determine the appropriate reimbursement rates for publicly funded child care. The rates must be adequate to ensure equal access to child care for families with limited incomes.

OAC
Ohio Administrative Code

Office of Family Assistance (OFA)
The ODJFS, Office of Family Assistance, is responsible for the state's publicly funded child care program, the licensure of child care centers and family child care homes, and Step Up To Quality. In SFY 2016, the child care program was managed by the following individuals:

Kara Wente, Deputy Director, OFA
Mindy Kowalaski, Chief, Policy and Operations
Tracey Chestnut, Chief, Bureau of Child Care Policy and TA
Michelle Albast, Chief, Bureau of Child Care Operational Support
Jeffery Van Deusen, Chief, Bureau of Child Care Licensing and Monitoring

ORC
Ohio Revised Code

Publicly Funded Child Care (PFCC)
Child care reimbursed in whole or part by government funding while parents engage in work or approved school or training activities. The income guidelines changed effective September 28, 2015 from 125 percent to 130 percent of the FPL at the initial eligibility determination and from 200 percent to 300 percent of the FPL for on-going eligibility.

Quality
In child care, the degree to which children are safe, healthy and receive appropriate stimulation. High-quality care settings are responsive; allow children to form secure attachments to nurturing adults; offer engaging, appropriate activities that facilitate healthy growth and development; and either prepare children for school or promote their success in school.

SUTQ
Step Up To Quality, Ohio's quality rating improvement system for care and education programs.

Type A Home
A child care setting that also is the permanent residence of the administrator, who may care for seven to 12 children at one time, including any children under 6 who are related to the administrator or to an employee.

Type B Home
A child care setting that also is the permanent residence of the administrator, who may care for one to six children at one time but no more than three children under age 2. If Type B home provider cares for children eligible for the publicly funded child care program, the provider must be licensed by the Ohio Department of Job and Family Services.