December 18, 2015

Cynthia C. Dungey, Director
Ohio Department of Job and Family Services
30 E. Broad Street, 32nd Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3414

Dear Director Dungey:

We are pleased to present the state fiscal year (SFY) 2015 Ohio Child Care Advisory Council (CCAC) Annual Report. This report provides information on the discussions, input and actions of the Council during the past year.

The CCAC is committed to quality care and education services for all children. Our efforts have been focused on supporting the system change in Ohio through the Early Learning Challenge Grant and the implementation of the 5-star Quality Rating and Improvement system (QRIS) while supporting families to ensure they have access to high quality child care. Our efforts are directed at developing an appropriate balance between these interests in pursuit of the best system of care for children, parents, providers and communities while maintaining a focus on availability, accessibility, affordability and quality to children and families.

The CCAC is an example of a high functioning ongoing partnership between a regulatory agency and its community. Together, the CCAC and the Ohio Department of Job and Family Services have worked to maintain a rigorous focus on the consumer needs while ensuring high quality access to families and children. We have worked collaboratively on many complicated issues this year.

Sincerely,

Pamela M. Perrino, Chair
Ohio Child Care Advisory Council

cc:
Michael McCreight, Assistant Director, Health and Human Services
Kara Bertke-Wente, Deputy Director
Michelle Albast, Bureau Chief
Tracey Chestnut, Bureau Chief
Jeffery Van Deusen, Bureau Chief
# Table of Contents

*Statute Creating the Ohio Child Care Advisory Council* ................................................................. 4
*Composition of Council* .................................................................................................................. 4
*State Fiscal Year (SFY) 2015 Council Members* ........................................................................... 5
*CCAC Committees* ......................................................................................................................... 6
*Standing Committees* ..................................................................................................................... 6
  - Policy Sub-Committee ......................................................................................................................... 6
  - Information Technology Sub-Committee ............................................................................................... 6
*Ad-Hoc Committees* ......................................................................................................................... 6
  - Rural Child Care Services .................................................................................................................. 6
  - Step Up To Quality (SUTQ) Survey ................................................................................................. 7
*Availability* ......................................................................................................................................... 7
*Accessibility* ......................................................................................................................................... 7
*Affordability* ....................................................................................................................................... 8
*Quality* ................................................................................................................................................ 9
*Administrative* ..................................................................................................................................... 9
*Glossary of Terms/Acronyms* ............................................................................................................ 10
Statute Creating the Ohio Child Care Advisory Council

Section 5104.08 of the Ohio Revised Code (ORC) directs the creation of the Ohio Child Care Advisory Council. This council is to advise and assist the Ohio Department of Job and Family Services (ODJFS) in the administration of Chapter 5104. ORC and the development of statewide child care policies and procedures.

Council meetings are open to the public and are held the third Wednesday of each month. Agendas consist of discussions regarding current issues in child care, updates from ODJFS’ Office of Family Assistance and needed action items to fulfill the council’s charge.

Composition of Council

Section 5104.08 ORC states: "The council shall consist of twenty-two voting members appointed by the director of job and family services with the approval of the governor. The director of job and family services, the director of developmental disabilities, the director of mental health and addiction services, the superintendent of public instruction, the director of health, the director of commerce, and the state fire marshal shall serve as nonvoting members of the council.

“Six members shall be representatives of child care centers subject to licensing, the members to represent a variety of centers, including nonprofit and proprietary, from different geographical areas of the state. At least three members shall be parents, guardians or custodians of children receiving child care or publicly funded child care in the child’s own home, a center, a type A home, a head start program, a certified type B home, or a type B home at the time of appointment. Three members shall be representatives of in-home aides, type A homes, certified type B homes or head start programs. At least six members shall represent county departments of job and family services. The remaining members shall be representatives of the teaching, child development and health professions, and other individuals interested in the welfare of children. At least six members of the council shall not be employees or licensees of a child day-care center, head start program or type A home, or providers operating a certified type B home or type B home, or in-home aides. Members volunteer for three-year terms. To maintain their voting membership, they must attend at least six of 12 meetings held each year.”
# State Fiscal Year (SFY) 2015 Council Members

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Member Name</th>
<th>Representation Type</th>
<th>Member Name</th>
<th>Representation Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Burnette, Danielle</td>
<td>CDJFS</td>
<td>Bellmore-Pierse, Nicolle</td>
<td>Parent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mettler, Kelly</td>
<td>CDJFS</td>
<td>Stertzbach, Sarah</td>
<td>Parent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wallace, Lolita</td>
<td>CDJFS</td>
<td>Watson, Kate</td>
<td>Parent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smith, Dwaine</td>
<td>CDJFS</td>
<td>Bieber, Michelle</td>
<td>Proprietary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Story, Amy</td>
<td>CDJFS</td>
<td>Lindley, Jim</td>
<td>Proprietary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scarberry, Whitney</td>
<td>CDJFS</td>
<td>Selway, Paula</td>
<td>Proprietary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boggs, Maureen</td>
<td>Community Professional</td>
<td>Montana, Gail</td>
<td>Type A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brannum, Teri</td>
<td>Community Professional</td>
<td>Haile, Asyia</td>
<td>Type B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perrino, Pam</td>
<td>Community Professional</td>
<td>Shipley, Patricia</td>
<td>Type B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward, Elaine</td>
<td>Community Professional</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jones, Lori</td>
<td>Not-for-profit</td>
<td>Batchelder, Michael</td>
<td>Ohio Council 8/AFSCME</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Johnson, Tasha</td>
<td>Not-for-profit</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Piazza-King, Julie</td>
<td>Not-for-profit</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Ex-Officio Members

| Courts, Melissa   | Ohio Department of Health |                          | Ohio Department of Commerce/Building Standards |
| Saunders, Diane   | Ohio Department of Education| Johnson, Ron            | Ohio Department of Commerce/State Fire Marshal |
| Alloy, Valerie    | Ohio Department of Mental Health and Addiction Services | Hauck, Kim | Ohio Department of Developmental Disabilities |
**CCAC Committees**

**Standing Committees**

**Policy Sub-Committee**
The Policy Committee is responsible for developing recommendations to inform the planning and development of child care policies, procedures and regulations. The committee focuses on the health and safety of children and the overall quality of all child care settings. It is charged with the following:

- Reviewing existing rules and participating in the ODJFS rule revision and reduction project including:
  - Updates and revisions to Chapter 5101:2-16 of the Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) in preparation for the five year rule review.
  - Review and consolidation of Chapter 5101:2-12, 5101:2-13 and 5101:2-14 OAC. This process will ultimately lead to one chapter of rules for both Type A and Type B family child care homes and a reduction of rules for both family child care and center licensing rules by realigning the rules to make them more concise and consumer friendly.
- Gathering and disseminating relevant research from other states and sources to inform and contribute to the process.
- Ensuring that Ohio’s child care policies encourage essential and foundational health, safety and developmentally appropriate practices and quality standards.
- Recommending policy changes to ensure accountability, accessibility, affordability and high quality to the consumer.
- Providing feedback on current rules, federal guidelines and state initiatives such as the state’s Step Up To Quality (SUTQ) star rating system and its impact on the consumer and provider.

**Information Technology Sub-Committee**
The Information Technology (IT) Committee is responsible for developing recommendations to ODJFS on ways to enhance the Child Care Information Data System (CCIDS). CCIDS streamlines and centralizes the administration of publicly funded child care in Ohio. It helps county agency caseworkers determine eligibility for services, authorizes children to specific providers and issues direct deposit payments to providers. In addition the committee makes recommendation to the Electronic Child Care (ECC) swipe card system used to record children’s time and attendance. The committee is charged with the following:

- Reviewing various communications materials for Ohio ECC and providing input.
- Providing recommendations to the department for enhancements.
- Focusing on enhancements to current child care systems that create efficiencies and automated tools for the department, users and stakeholders.

**Ad-Hoc Committees**

**Rural Child Care Services**
The Rural Child Care Ad-Hoc Committee is charged to provide recommendations to improve the affordability, the availability and the quality of child care services for consumers in rural communities of Ohio. The committee analyzes data and identifies how rural counties needs are similar and different from urban child care needs. Once the data is reviewed the committee identifies policy and or rules that may inhibit increased child care quality and access in rural areas. Once these have been identified, recommendations are brought forth to the Child Care Advisory Council. The committee is charged with the following:

- Collect data and reviewed the data looking for obstacles and gaps.
**Step Up To Quality (SUTQ) Survey**
The SUTQ Ad-Hoc Committee determines benefits and barriers in reaching the desired SUTQ Rating within the state wide child care system. The committee is charged with the following:

- Explore discussion points for creating priorities to ensure increased participation in SUTQ.
- Inventory current data available and then identify additional data necessary to guide the work in identifying barriers to providers in obtaining, maintaining, or increasing quality rating.
  - Connect other agencies and organizations that have relevant data such as ODE and groundWork to inform work and directions.

**Availability**

**Council Recommendations and Discussions Concerning Availability:**

**Training**
- Recommends that ODJFS should consider a statewide provider training on the administration of medication to improve health and safety for children as well as a requirement that this be a mandatory training.

**Increase Programs Participating in SUTQ**
- Recommends that discussion of the cost of quality, especially as it impacts rural areas, move to the state’s Early Childhood Advisory Council.
- Recommends the creation of an Ad-Hoc group to create a SUTQ survey to inventory current data available and then identify additional data necessary to guide the work in identifying barriers to providers in obtaining, maintaining or increasing their SUTQ rating.
- Encourages the continued conversation to explore the feasibility of ODE and ODJFS establishing one set of rules by 2025.

**School Readiness**
- Recommends that no four year old child who is in publicly funded child care should lose the ability to attend a publicly funded licensed provider the year before they enter kindergarten.
- Examine gaps between metropolitan counties and rural counties in the availability of child care and identify availability gaps for families and children in Ohio.
  - In some rural counties less than one percent of the children under six years old have access to licensed child care.
  - In fifty six counties less than twenty percent of the children under six years old have access to licensed child care.

**Accessibility**

**Council Recommendations and Discussions Concerning Accessibility:**

**Rural Child Care**
- Examine gaps between metropolitan counties and rural counties in the availability of child care and identify gaps for children in Ohio.
  - Seven counties are without any star rated child care programs.
- Based on the data, the recommendation was made that the Child Care Advisory Council should create a survey that would identify the barriers to programs to participate in SUTQ or when increasing a star rating.
- Further recommendation was made to contact groundWork, Early Childhood Advisory Council (ECAC) and the Ohio Child Care Resource and Referral Association (OCCRA) to identify other current data available on the topic.
• Recommends that a letter should be drafted to ODJFS Director Dungey regarding sustainability of rural programs movement within the existing child care system. This should include asking for the Director’s support to take rural issues to the ECAC to ensure a larger scope of focus on the issue.

School Age Child Care Authorization
• Requests ODJFS to reexamine a school age child part time authorization and the roll out to occur through the summer or allow the authorization to be a full time authorization with school age hours backed out. A year round authorization that does not change is preferred.

Updates and Communication from Other Parts of the System
• Requests that leaders from various parts of the early care and education system provide updates to the CCAC at monthly meetings to ensure the committee has the most up to date knowledge and data when making recommendations.
  o Early Childhood Advisory Council
  o groundWork
  o Ohio Head Start Association
  o Others as identified through our work

SUTQ Forms
• Recommends that ODJFS review several forms currently being used for desk audits and initial application for SUTQ to ensure ease of access and elimination of duplication.

Information Technology
• Recommends that ODJFS develop and implement a future authorization report for providers. The report will allow providers to see completed child authorizations for the current week and the next two weeks prior to being seen in Ohio ECC.
  o Daily report is now available to providers via the portal.
• Request ODJFS encourage and allow providers to assist families with initial eligibility determination, by addressing the confidentiality concern regarding information sharing between the county and the provider.
  o Modified the Application for Child Care Benefits (JFS 01138) to permit this information exchange.
• Recommends that ODJFS create training for providers to include explanations of administrator rules, adjustments, manual claims, and guidance regarding staff turnover. This training should be offered quarterly one-on-one and regionally in the form of a webinar, hands-on training events and conferences.

Affordability
Council Recommendations and Discussion Concerning Affordability:
Market Rate Survey
• Recommends that ODJFS consider a different approach to the market rate survey as the process is costly and no adjustments have been implemented since 2009. Half of the licensed child care centers in the state do not serve children in publicly funded child care and do not participate in the market rate survey. This lack of participation compromises the results. Consider making participation in the market rate survey mandatory for all licensed programs to ensure accurate market rate results.
• Recommends that reimbursement rates be brought closer in line with the actual cost to provide quality service, with a particular focus on the needs in rural regions.
Quality

Council Recommendations and Discussion Concerning Quality:

Step Up To Quality Survey
- Recommends the creation of a survey to be administrated to all ODJFS licensed providers. The purpose of the survey is to identify obstacles that programs are experiencing in entering, maintaining or increasing their SUTQ rating.

Smoke Free Environment
- Recommends that policy should be developed to include the criteria that children should not be exposed to cigarette butts, spittoons, ashes, etc.

State Student Identifier (SSID)
- Recommends that all children in licensed child care settings be issued an SSID number, as the purpose of the SSID number is to track development of children prior to kindergarten entry by identifying which types of programs and services have the greatest impact on school readiness. Currently only children receiving publicly funded child care are issued an SSID number and that only represents one third of the children currently being served in licensed programs. Only highly rated programs are required to complete an assessment to capture development.

Infant and Toddlers
- Discussions centered on Ohio’s current definition of an infant. Data from other states has been presented and reviewed in regards to Ohio’s current definition and ratios. Following suggestions have been discussed:
  - Redefine infant as birth to 12 months.
    - Change ratio from 1:5 or 2:12 to 1:4 which aligns with national recommendations and best practice.
    - This would then only require cribs be used for children up to 12 months of age.
    - These changes would increase access for toddlers by opening floor space.
    - Would align Ohio to best practice and ratios held by 75% of the other states.

Annual Inspection
- Reviewed wording for policy and rule on inspections to ensure that anyone providing child care regardless of license type receive at least one inspection visit per year.

Administrative
In preparing the SFY 2015 Annual Report, the CCAC held a short strategic planning meeting to guide our work moving forward into SFY 2016 year.

Council Recommendations
- Identify key areas of focus for work moving forward.
  - Increase the number of programs participating in SUTQ.
    - Identify barriers to programs.
    - Use data to drive policy recommendations for change to SUTQ to ensure ease of use and access.
  - Strengthen consumer knowledge about quality and SUTQ.
  - Use data to substantiate concerns generated by observations when making recommendations.
Glossary of Terms/Acronyms
This glossary of terms is provided as a convenience for readers of this report.

Accessibility
The availability of child care when and where a family needs it.

Affordability
The degree to which the price of child care is a feasible family expense. High-quality care may be available, but it may not be affordable for families with low or moderate incomes.

AFSCME
AFSCME, Local Council 8, is the leading union for public and nonprofit workers in Ohio. It has more than 41,000 members in more than 300 local unions representing city, county, hospital and university employees, along with boards of education, nonprofit workers and other public service employees.

Availability
The degree to which a family has ready access to needed child care. Factors affecting this include not only geographic location, but also the availability of care for the child’s age and at the needed time of day.

Office of Family Assistance (OFA)
The ODJFS, Office of Family Assistance, is responsible for the state’s publicly funded child care program, the licensure of child care centers and family child care homes, and Step Up To Quality. In SFY 2015, the child care program was managed by the following individuals:

- Kara Bertke Wente, Deputy Director, OFA
- Tracey Chestnut, Chief, Bureau of Child Care Policy and TA
- Michelle Albast, Chief, Bureau of Child Care Operational Support
- Jeffery Van Deusen, Chief, Bureau of Child Care Licensing and Monitoring
- Stephanie Shafer, Project Manager, Automated Child Care Systems
- Lisa Walsh, Project Manager, Early Learning Challenge Grant
- Mindy Kowlaski, Project Manager, Early Learning Challenge Grant

Child Care Information Data System (CCIDS)
The automated statewide system that helps county caseworkers determine families’ eligibility for publicly funded child care services; authorizes individual children to specific providers; issues direct deposit payments to providers; tracks each child’s attendance times with the child care provider; and calculates the payment to be made for child care services. CCIDS has many subsystems:

- Licensing
- 3299
- Eligibility and Authorization
- Centralized Payments
- Ohio Electronic Child Care
- Provider Portal
- COLTS-SOLAR
- SUTQ
- Outlier Technology-Automated Inspection Tool
**Child Care Center**
Any place that is not the permanent residence of the licensee or administrator in which child care is provided, with or without compensation, for seven to 12 children at one time, or any place in which child care is provided for 13 or more children at one time. Child care centers must comply with all rules in OAC Chapter 5101:2-12.

**COLTS**
The Central Office License Tracking System, a web-based system used by state staff to process and manage license applications submitted by child care providers.

**Continuous Licensing**
The child care licensing system used in Ohio, in which licenses do not expire but can be revoked if providers become noncompliant with state laws, rules and policies. Child care facilities undergo regularly scheduled inspections and visits.

**Centralized Payments (CP)**
Centralized Payments is the integrated statewide system for paying providers. CP stores provider banking, rate and agreement information and receives payment information from the Electronic Child Care system.

**Council**
Advisory body to an agency or department.

**Domains**
Areas of development that occur during the early childhood years and support school readiness strategies.

**Eligibility and Authorization (EA)**
The case management system used to process applications, determine eligibility and authorize services for families receiving publicly funded child care in Ohio.

**Early Childhood Assessment System (ELCG)**
An assessment system used by classroom teachers, professionals and para-professionals to assess the education and proficiency level of children in the educational setting.

**Early Childhood Ohio**
A website designed to provide early childhood professionals with the latest resources and updates to promote school readiness for the children of Ohio.

**Family Child Care Homes**
Child care providers that are regulated to provide services to children at their residence (Type A and Type B).

**Federal Poverty Levels (FPL)**
Guidelines set annually by the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services to help determine the incomes at which families may be eligible for public assistance programs.

**Gross Income**
The income used to determine eligibility for PFCC benefits.
**Initial eligibility**
The initial determination review to determine if a family is eligible for child care benefits. The current initial gross income requirement is 130 percent of the FPG.

**Market Rate Survey**
A biannual, federally mandated survey. The 2014 survey was conducted by ODJFS in partnership with the Ohio State University Statistical Consulting Service to collect data to determine the appropriate reimbursement rates for publicly funded child care. The rates must be adequate to ensure equal access to child care for families with limited incomes.

**OAC**
Ohio Administrative Code

**OACCP**
Ohio Association of Child Care Providers

**OCCRA**
Ohio Child Care Resource and Referral Association

**ODJFS**
Ohio Department of Job and Family Services

**Ohio ECC**
Ohio Electronic Child Care

**On-going eligibility**
Determination of continuation of child care benefits after the initial determination and approval was made for child care benefits.

**ORC**
Ohio Revised Code

**PIN**
Personal identification number. Caretakers in the publicly funded child care program choose PIN numbers for their swipe cards so they can record their children’s time and attendance in child care.

**Program Integrity**
The degree of compliance, quality and efficiency that exists in a program. In Ohio’s child care program, program integrity is achieved through monitoring and fraud control efforts, such as data mining to detect unusual time and attendance patterns that may indicate misuse of the system.

**Publicly Funded Child Care (PFCC)**
Child care reimbursed in whole or part by government funding while parents engage in work or approved school or training activities. In Ohio, to be eligible for publicly funded child care initially, a family’s gross income must not exceed 125 percent of the FPL. After that, families may remain eligible until their gross income exceeds 200 percent of the FPL. The income guidelines changed effective September 28, 2015 from 125
percent to 130 percent of the FPL at the initial eligibility determination and from 200 percent to 300 percent of
the FPL for on-going eligibility.

**Quality**
In child care, the degree to which children are safe, healthy and receive appropriate stimulation. High-quality
care settings are responsive; allow children to form secure attachments to nurturing adults; offer engaging,
appropriate activities that facilitate healthy growth and development; and either prepare children for school or
promote their success in school.

**RttT ELCG**
Race to the Top – Early Learning Challenge Grant. Ohio was one of nine states in the nation to receive this
federal grant, which will provide nearly $70 million to the state over three years to improve school readiness
programs for children with high needs.

**Serious Risk Noncompliance**
A failure to follow a law, regulation, rule or policy that results in a great risk of harm to children.

**SOLAR**
System for Online Licensing Applications and Requests; a web-based system used by administrators at child
care centers and Type A Homes to create, store, edit and submit licensing applications to ODJFS.

**Standards**
Minimum quality benchmarks required for child care programs to be licensed, certified or to achieve star ratings
in the Step Up To Quality program.

**SUTQ**
Step Up To Quality, Ohio’s quality rating system for care and education programs.

**Type A Home**
A child care setting that also is the permanent residence of the administrator, who may care for seven to 12
children at one time, including any children under 6 who are related to the administrator or to an employee. If
four or more children are under 2, four to 12 children may be cared for at one time.

**Type B Home**
A child care setting that also is the permanent residence of the administrator, who may care for one to six
children at one time but no more than three children under age 2. If Type B Homes care for children in the
publicly funded child care program, they must be certified by a county department of job and family services.